

# The 7 Most Endangered 2013

## Project Fact Sheet

<b><u>Project Title</u></b>	<b>Monastery and Church of Jesus in Setúbal, PORTUGAL</b>
<b><u>Location</u></b>	<b>Setúbal, Portugal</b>
<b><u>Initial input date</u></b>	<b>08.2017</b>
<b><u>Current status</u></b>	<b>Post follow-up</b>
<b><u>Latest update</u></b>	<b>09.2018</b>

### **Summary, status, prognosis**

Renovation of an historic church and convent in an urban environment.

Major works to be undertaken in phases with the first significant phase satisfactorily completed and in use (from 2014). The overall concept has been reviewed and somewhat modified and the phases adapted, mainly to the availability of suitable funding. The second series of works, comprising the completion of two wings, the rehabilitation of the Church and improvements to surrounding areas, were launched in 2017 and are estimated to cost about € 7.5 M in all. Funding is secured for € 3 M, and these works are almost completed or about to be being committed. The further final phases should follow later when funding becomes available but with the works now completed (or shortly to be so) the essential objective of the project will have been achieved.

A promising outcome with further monitoring suggested.

**Classification: B Good progress**

### **Basic data**

#### **Nominator:**

Hugo O'Neill, EN member, President Assoc. Portuguesa das Casa Antigas.

#### **Brief description:**

Historical buildings, place of worship, historical heritage site.

#### **Owner:**

Ministry of Culture (D.G. Património Cultural) – had endorsed the submission.

#### **Administrator:**

Câmara Municipal de Setúbal - had endorsed the submission

### **Context, description**

The buildings, situated in the heart of the town (population 128 000), comprise a Church and adjacent Convent and have great historical and architectural significance.

Completed in 1491 by the famous architect Master Diogo de Boitaca for the Poor Clare's order. The Treaty of Tordesillas was signed here in 1494 by John II King of Portugal then living at Setubal. It remained a Convent until 1834 when it passed to the State and eventually converted to a hospital which closed in 1959. Serious deterioration set in and in 1990 it was closed.

The Owner conceived a programme of renovation and extension to create a viable Church and adjacent Municipal museum. In 2001, following an international competition, an overall scheme was adopted and later modified. Some external funds from ERDF (and also the EIB) became available to augment the local funds to allow the first phase to proceed, and this was to be followed later by more substantial works.

### **Issues, problems, threats**

The main threat was due to delays in supporting and repairing the buildings which would deteriorate further with serious risk of collapse in places. A flood risk also needed addressing. General deterioration with age, compounded by lack of maintenance, and inappropriate previous repairs, have all contributed to the poor state of the buildings.

Funding was always and remains a concern.

### **Status pre-mission**

A first phase was started in December 2012 comprising essential repairs to the church and the major reconstruction of one wing, to provide space to initiate the proposed museum. An optimistic contractual completion date of September 2013 was set. The estimated overall cost was 3.5 M €. Local, Government and ERDF funds were used.

The main construction phase with completion of the courtyard and adjacent wings and the new extensions would eventually follow and was estimated to cost some 15 M €.

In September 2013 when the EN/EIBI appraisal took place the works were blocked with a major dispute with the contractor, notably on timber quality. Concern was also raised on the continual validity of the ERDF funding due to the inevitable delays. It was seriously being considered by the Administrator to cancel the construction contract. These matters were discussed during the mission.

### **Summary EN/EIBI mission recommendations, action programme**

The Technical report was issued in November 2013 (available on the EN website).

It reviewed and revised the programme and costs, notably of the first phase. It recommended, and instigated discussions with the appropriate Ministries in Lisbon to ensure the extension of the ERDF funding, this being a delegated responsibility.

It also recommended making every effort to negotiate with and encourage the local main contractor to continue, all within the contractual conditions. Cancelling the contract would have been complicated, expensive and entailed long delays. Firmer project management of the contractor, his suppliers and sub-contractors was also recommended.

It was proposed that the second phase should be reviewed and refined.

Suggestions for funding were also put forward.

### **Progress on recommendations and latest status**

The report, its conclusions and recommendations were well received by all involved i.e. the Nominator, the Administrator and the Ministries, and were generally acted upon.

In particular, despite delays, the contract was reconvened as recommended and the funding from the ERDF was unblocked. This has resulted in the first phase being completed by March 2014, with some 8 months delay. Costs increased by some 15% but the resulting quality was deemed good.

The formal opening of the Museum, first phase, took place successfully in June 2015.

The subsequent phases have been revised and considerably modified with a reduced

concept, dictated partly by availability of funds. In mid 2017 a second phase has been launched comprising the completion and renovation of the north and east wings, the Church and High Choir and improvements to the surrounding areas but without any of the new buildings initially proposed. The main structural elements of these components are currently planned for completion by end 2018 (total cost € 1.5 M). Associated finishing works are still at planning stage (estimated cost €2 M). External works are now funded and should start very soon (October 2018) with cost of € 1.5 M. Other works (technical building, archaeological work) are required for full completion (€ 2.5 M).

Overall costs are estimated at about € 11 M, with € 5 M virtually completed, a further € 1.5 committed and the remaining € 4.5 M still outstanding. Funding has been from various Government and EU sources.

In summary, the Museum is successfully active and a further extension will soon be completed with the final phases to complete the revised overall concept being planned.

## **Impact of EIBI/EN intervention**

### **Nominator's Comments:**

The intervention of EN/EIB Institute was of paramount importance for the clarification of the items in dispute between the Administrator, the Architect author of the project and the Contractor.

The stringent financial rules for the indebtedness capacity of Municipalities prevented the Administrator from acceding to the funds required to complete the works. A revision of the original project resulting in a tightening in the size of the investment, together with a strong improvement in cash flow management and a more favourable financial environment, has now enabled the Administrator to seek further funds to finish the rehabilitation works. The completion of these works will enable the conversion of the Convent's south and east wings to become the home of the Museum of Setubal. This will enhance the return of Setubal to its due rank as an historical site of exceptional importance, being the place where King John II effectively launched what became the Portuguese Empire. The Convent is the tangible memory of those times, including a unique collection of primitive late XV century paintings, made for the Church's main altar. The conclusion of these works will help improve Setúbal as a major cultural tourist destination, increasing the number of visitors who can appreciate the beauty of this authentic yet slightly rundown place and this should also encourage further urban rehabilitation.

### **Appraisal Team's Comments:**

An important heritage project, which was well prepared and strongly supported locally. Guidance given on the project management and the funding were helpful to the successful completion of phase one. Suggestions for the main phase seem also to have been taken into consideration. The programme is advancing steadily, with a second phase being launched in 2017 and now being implemented. The final stages are under active planning.

Overall a satisfactory outcome, to be continued into these final phases.

## **Lessons learned:**

- Success was largely due to the strong and well-coordinated support from both local and national entities in Portugal; this also included giving priority for funding and continuing with support over time. These actions were positively guided by the EN/EIBI intervention which was well accepted and acted upon.
- Behind this was a real "gem" of a project which made these efforts worthwhile. So initial selection of potentially sound projects important.
- The EN/EIBI mission's conclusions were made clear during the mission itself and immediately afterwards with the recommendations being transferred in writing to the parties, well before the issuing of the Technical Report. This timely feed-back was effective and important.
- Follow-up post appraisal has been effective in supporting progress.

**Data on inputs & timing****Dates, Participants****Appraisal:**

Nomination form submitted	March 2013
Project selected as 7 ME:	June 2013
Questionnaire from EIBI	July 2013
Response to questionnaire	August 2013
Appraisal mission	4 - 5 September 2013
Participants:- EN EIB Institute	José-Maria Ballester. Pedro Ponce de León. Peter Bond, Guy Clausse
Feedback letter post mission	11 September 2013
Response to further questions	10 October 2013
<b>Technical report</b> issued	November 2013

**Follow-up:**

Request for <b>progress report</b>	29 April 2014      August 2018
Response on progress	29 June 2014      September 2018
Follow-up visit	30 October 2014      none
Participants: EN EIB Institute	- Peter Bond
Report on follow-up visit	10 November 2014
Fact sheet prepared by	Peter Bond 2014 Peter Bond 2018